

Federal Communications Commission 445 12th St., S.W. Washington, D.C. 20554

News Media Information 202 / 418-0500 Fax-On-Demand 202 / 418-2830 TTY 202 / 418-2555 Internet: http://www.fcc.gov

> DA 12-683 Released: April 30, 2012

## WIRELINE COMPETITION BUREAU ANNOUNCES APPLICATION PROCEDURES AND DEADLINE FOR APPLICATIONS TO PARTICIPATE IN THE BROADBAND ADOPTION LIFELINE PILOT PROGRAM

WC Docket No. 11-42

Pilot Applications Due: July 2, 2012

In this Public Notice, the Wireline Competition Bureau (Bureau) announces the application criteria for eligible telecommunications carriers (ETCs) and their partners interested in competing for a portion of the \$25 million the Commission has budgeted for a broadband adoption pilot program for low-income consumers (Pilot Program). At the conclusion of the Pilot Program, "the Commission will publicly recognize the ETCs and their partners that best succeed [] in meeting the Pilot Program goals."<sup>1</sup>

In the *Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM*, the Commission created the Pilot Program to gather data to test how the Lifeline program could be structured to promote the adoption and retention of broadband services by low-income households.<sup>2</sup> The Commission directed the Bureau "to solicit applications from ETCs to participate in the Pilot Program and to select a relatively small number of projects to test the impact on broadband adoption with variations in the monthly discount (phased down over time or constant) over a 12-month period" that will provide data that will enable the Commission to evaluate how best to structure the program in the future.<sup>3</sup> The Commission authorized up to \$25 million for funding of the Pilot Program to be disbursed directly to ETCs for up to 12 months of subsidized

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Lifeline and Link Up Reform and Modernization; Lifeline and Link Up; Federal-State Joint Board on Universal Service; Advancing Broadband Availability Through Digital Literacy Training, WC Dkt. Nos. 11-42, 03-109, CC Dkt. No. 96-45, WC Dkt. No. 12-23, Report and Order and Further Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, FCC 12-11 at para. 326 (rel. Feb. 6, 2012) (Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM).

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$  See id. at para. 323.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See id. at paras. 325. Prior to filing an application, any carrier that wishes to participate in the Pilot Program must be designated as an ETC to provide voice service in any geographic area for which it seeks to participate in the Pilot Program, with a limited exception for Tribal entities. *See id.* at para. 335 (permitting Tribally-owned or controlled entities to submit a proposal even though they have ETC applications pending at the time they submit an application to participate in the Pilot Program; Tribal entities must obtain ETC designation prior to receiving support under the Pilot Program); *see also* 47 C.F.R. § 54.101 (establishing voice telephony service as the supported service and requiring that an ETC must offer such service in order to receive universal service support).

broadband service either through bundles of voice and broadband services or as standalone broadband service.<sup>4</sup> As described in greater detail below, ETCs seeking to participate in the Pilot Program should submit an application describing each of their proposed projects.

The Commission required ETCs submitting pilot projects to commit to robust data gathering and sharing of subscribers' anonymized data.<sup>5</sup> The Bureau has structured the Pilot Program to minimize administrative costs that participants must bear and encourages ETCs to identify ways to share such costs with other participants where possible. Universal Service Administrative Company (USAC) will be tasked with collecting data from ETCs regarding subscriber demographics and broadband usage pursuant to a uniform set of questions set forth in the Low Income Broadband Pilot Program Reporting Form, attached as Appendix, which should be completed by subscribers participating in the Pilot Program.<sup>6</sup> ETCs may collect the data themselves and submit to USAC, or may request that USAC collect the subscriber data referenced in Appendix directly from ETCs' subscribers through an electronic, online survey; ETCs should specify their preference regarding data collection in their project applications.

## Pilot projects as field experiments:

The primary goal of the Pilot Program is to gather high-quality data that will help identify effective approaches to increasing broadband adoption and retention by low-income consumers.<sup>7</sup> The Commission encouraged "ETCs to utilize control groups in order to better assess the impact on adoption of the project."<sup>8</sup> To achieve this goal in the selection process, the Bureau will strongly favor pilot projects designed as field experiments that implement standard best practices common among field experiments.<sup>9</sup> In their applications, ETCs should submit a detailed description of the experimental design and other experimental protocols used suitable for a replication study, what variations on broadband service offerings will be tested (*e.g.*, discount amount, duration of discount, speeds, usage limits, digital literacy training or any other factors impacting broadband adoption) and how the project(s) will randomize variations on broadband service offerings (*e.g.*, geographic randomization).<sup>10</sup> Individual applicants, however, are not required to incorporate an extensive number of potential variations of broadband service in their projects; rather, the Bureau expects to test a range of variations by selecting multiple projects.

<sup>7</sup> See Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM, FCC 12-11 at para. 323.

<sup>8</sup> *Id.* at para. 326.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM, FCC 12-11 at para. 324-325

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> *See id.* at para. 336.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> As detailed in the Low Income Broadband Pilot Program Reporting Form, participating ETCs or USAC, at the request of the ETC, are expected to obtain information from subscribers at least twice during the course of the individual pilot project(s): when the subscriber first initiates service and towards the conclusion of the project. *See* Appendix (providing the standardized questions that ETCs or USAC would ask to participating subscribers regarding demographics and service usage). The Bureau reserves the right to modify the standardized questions included within Appendix prior to selection of projects for the Pilot Program.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See John A. List, Why Economists Should Conduct Field Experiments and 14 Tips for Pulling One Off, Journal of Economic Perspectives, Volume 25, No. 3, Summer 2011, at 10-14 (explains value of field experiments and offers a quick "best practices" summary via 14 tips); Steven D. Levitt and John A. List, Field Experiments in Economics: the Past, the Present and the Future, European Economic Review (2009).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See infra section I.E.1 (explaining the details of what should be included in an ETC's field experiment).

The Bureau encourages ETCs to partner with experts in the design of field experiments as well as third-party organizations working to increase broadband adoption. Such partners may include academic researchers, social research organizations, contract-research firms, or non-profit organizations. To facilitate such partnerships, the Bureau expects to hold a webinar on May 14, 2012 with such third party experts to discuss options of how to design projects within this Pilot Program and to answer questions regarding the application procedures.<sup>11</sup> ETCs and experts in the design of field experiments, as well as those that have existing broadband adoption programs in place, are encouraged to independently contact each other to form partnerships.<sup>12</sup>

## Factors the Bureau will consider in choosing pilot projects:

The Commission directed the Bureau to select a diverse array of projects testing broadband adoption in different geographic areas (*e.g.*, rural, urban, Tribal lands), using different technologies (*e.g.* fixed, mobile) and testing different variations of broadband service and discount plans. The Commission has a particular interest in learning which discount plans are most effective in promoting broadband adoption and retention. Discount plans tested in the pilot projects may include variations in the amount of the discount, the length of time the discount is applied, and whether the discount amount is applied to recurring or non-recurring charges. Pilot projects may also vary in other dimensions of the broadband service, including speed and usage limits. Additionally, a pilot project may test, in conjunction with or separately from discount plans, the effectiveness of customer outreach methods aimed at overcoming adoption hurdles. We emphasize, however, that individual pilot projects are not required to incorporate numerous potential variations of broadband service.<sup>13</sup>

The Commission has directed the Bureau to consider certain other factors when choosing which projects to fund. For example, the Commission recognized the importance of digital literacy in encouraging broadband adoption and in providing the tools consumers need to exploit the benefits of broadband, and therefore the Bureau will give preference to projects that include partnerships with non-ETCs that already have existing adoption programs in place to provide digital literacy.<sup>14</sup> Such projects may also include a control group that does not receive digital literacy training. The Commission also recognized that lack of access to affordable equipment is a significant barrier to broadband adoption and directed the Bureau to consider when making selections the extent to which pilot projects test with appropriate control groups whether access to equipment can influence adoption.<sup>15</sup> Applicants should indicate whether their proposed projects promote entrepreneurship and small business, including those businesses that may be socially and economically disadvantaged.<sup>16</sup> Furthermore, the selection process will evaluate an applicant's ability to execute the proposal (in terms of funding and expert and third-party

<sup>13</sup> See Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM, FCC 12-11 at paras. 326, 341.

<sup>14</sup> *See id.* at para. 352.

<sup>15</sup> See id. at para. 348-349.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The Bureau has tentatively scheduled the May 14, 2012 webinar from 2:00 p.m. to 4:00 p.m. Eastern Daylight Time.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> In order to reduce design costs, applicants may consider collaborating with each other on project designs and partnerships.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> *Id.* at para. 326 ("The Bureau will consider whether the projects proposed will promote entrepreneurs and other small businesses in the provision and ownership of telecommunications services and information services, consistent with section 257 of the Communications Act, including those that may be socially and economically disadvantaged businesses.")

qualifications), and the value of the data to be collected in credibly addressing questions of interest. The Bureau will also consider the aggregate funding amounts requested for each pilot project when choosing a portfolio of projects to fund. In addition, in light of the very low broadband penetration rate on Tribal lands, the Commission directed the Bureau, in coordination with the Office of Native Affairs and Policy, to select at least one pilot project directed at providing support on Tribal lands.<sup>17</sup>

ETCs selected to participate in the Pilot Program must use the funds they receive from USAC to subsidize the services they provide to low-income consumers in the Pilot Program.<sup>18</sup> ETCs are encouraged to identify ways to share any administrative costs with other participants where possible. In order to minimize the burden of information collection on participating ETCs, ETCs have the option of requesting that USAC collect, in anonymized form through an electronic, online survey, standardized data elements from subscribers such as income, age, ethnicity, family size and details regarding subscriber usage. ETCs also have the option of collecting such information and submitting it directly to USAC twice during their project. In either case, in order to participate in the Pilot Program, ETCs must obtain consent from their subscribers to provide this information before enrolling them in the program. At the end of the program, participating ETCs are strongly encouraged to submit a final report sharing additional information with the Commission about lessons learned from the project, including the cost on a persubscriber basis of converting non-broadband adopters to broadband adopters, and any other information relevant to broadband adoption by low-income consumers including any analysis the ETC has performed on its own data. If the Commission event.

Data collected during each project must be submitted to USAC, must be anonymized and must be made publicly available in its anonymized form. ETCs and their partners will be allowed to publish research based on data collected during the Pilot Program.

## Trial Period:

The Commission envisioned the Pilot Program would occur over an 18-month period, with three months for ETCs to implement necessary back office functions, up to 12 months of subsidized service, and three months for finalization of data collection or analysis.<sup>19</sup> The Bureau anticipates that pilot projects will be selected during the third quarter of 2012. The Bureau will announce the beginning of the trial period when it announces the projects selected for the Pilot Program. The first three months of the trial period is available for ETCs to implement back-office functions, but ETCs have the option to begin offering the subsidized broadband service at any time during the initial three months of the trial period. In order to ensure that the Pilot Program produces high-quality data in a timely fashion that can be analyzed across all projects to better understand how to structure the Lifeline program in the future, we expect all subscribers to be enrolled within nine months of the commencement of the trial period.<sup>20</sup> However, we will entertain applications that specifically propose to enroll subscribers beyond the first nine months of the trial period, if the applicants offer a valid rationale for extending the enrollment

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> *See id.* at para. 350.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> See id. at para. 346.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> See Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM, FCC 12-11 at para. 325.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> See id. at para. 337 (authorizing the Bureau to grant up to six additional months for pilot projects to start up or wind down, provided no project offers more than 12 months of reduced-price service).

period. To the extent any applicant anticipates it would need more than three months to implement any back office functions and begin signing up customers, it should so specify in its pilot applications.<sup>21</sup>

## Pilot Project Application:

Pilot project applications must address the application requirements listed below. ETCs must submit their applications to the Commission **on or before July 2, 2012.** All applications must be complete by the filing deadline. ETCs, however, can provide supplemental information regarding their project after the deadline upon request of Commission staff.

Applicants are not required to submit a separate application for each proposed broadband service offering the applicant intends to include within its project. However, in the event an ETC includes in its project variations on discount amount, duration of discount, speeds, usage limits or any other factors impacting broadband adoption for different geographic areas, the application must include the relevant information with respect to its various proposed broadband service offerings.<sup>22</sup> Each variation of a proposed broadband service offering will be assigned a separate project code identifier by USAC (project code identifier).<sup>23</sup>

- I. All applications must include the following information:
  - (A) Names and identifiers used by the ETC applying for Pilot Program funding, including its holding company, operating company and all affiliates; its FCC Registration Number (FRN), study area codes (SACs), a list of states where the ETC is currently designated to provide Lifeline service; detailed information, including geographic locations, of the ETC's current service offerings in the market; and if a Tribal entity has an ETC designation pending, provide detailed information regarding the ETC application, including the proposed geographic locations;<sup>24</sup>
  - (B) A full description of the proposed pilot project(s), including but not limited to:

1. The geographic area(s) in which the ETC will offer the broadband plan(s) for their project(s), census data on the income levels of the residents of the specified geographic area(s) (census tracts, blocks or zip codes), and whether the geographic area(s) will cover Tribal lands;<sup>25</sup>

2. A description of the technology or technologies that will be used for the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> In the event that ETCs need more than three months to implement back-office functions before offering discounted broadband services, ETCs must still enroll new subscribers for the discounted broadband service within nine months from the beginning of the trial period.

 $<sup>^{22}</sup>$  As part of a project, if an ETC chooses to include a strategy of providing discounted broadband services for a period of less than 12 months, the ETC is still required to track and report data on adoption and retention for a minimum of 12 months so the Commission can evaluate whether consumers drop service when the discount is eliminated or reduced. *See id.* at para. 338.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Control groups used within each study will be assigned a separate project code identifier from the group of consumers offered a variation on the broadband service offering (i.e., treatment groups).

 $<sup>^{24}</sup>$  ETCs are required to submit the information contained in section I.A only once in the application even if they plan to test multiple variations within their proposed project(s).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> See Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM, FCC 12-11 at para. 350 (directing the Bureau, in coordination with Office of Native Affairs and Policy, to select at least one pilot project directed at providing support on Tribal lands).

broadband service;

3. The broadband speeds for the service offering(s) based on what is advertised by the ETC and if the offered speed is less than the benchmarks identified by the Commission, an explanation of why the speed is less than the benchmarks, and how the speed offered will provide consumers access to key applications involving education (*e.g.*, distance/online learning), healthcare (*e.g.*, remote health monitoring), and person-to-person communications (*e.g.*, online video chat);<sup>26</sup>

4. The amount of the monthly discount, if any, the ETC is seeking for each broadband plan included within the proposed project and the resulting cost to subscribers for the broadband service, the duration of the monthly subsidies the ETC is seeking, and all other terms and conditions of service (the ETC must provide specific details of all of the subsidized broadband offerings it intends to offer subscribers in the pilot project, including the different options of bundled services and/or standalone broadband and offerings with different usage limits or speed);<sup>27</sup>

5. The amount, if any, of a subsidy the ETC is seeking to reduce or eliminate any non-recurring fees, an explanation of the costs the non-recurring fees are used to cover and the resulting cost to subscribers of any non-recurring fees;

6. A detailed explanation of how the proposed pilot project will focus on those low-income consumers who do not currently subscribe to broadband;<sup>28</sup>

7. The project's proposed overall funding amount with details on the number of customers it is estimated to serve, with underlying assumptions;

8. A description of how the ETC will market the broadband service offering(s) to low-income consumers (*e.g.*, outreach to existing Lifeline voice subscribers, advertising in newspapers/radio, outreach through community-based organizations), the language(s) in which the ETC will market the service and copies of sample marketing materials if available; and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> See *id.* at para. 341. As explained in the *Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM*, the Bureau will give preference to ETCs that offer speeds at 4 Mbps for downloads and 1 Mbps for uploads. *See id.* at para. 326. For fixed broadband applications, the Commission specified a broadband speed benchmark of 4 Mbps for downloads and 1 Mbps for uploads. For mobile broadband applications, the Commission expected that Pilot Program participants would meet the benchmark speeds adopted for Mobility Fund Phase I support. For mobile broadband service, the ETC must specify whether the network delivering the service is characterized as third generation (3G) or fourth generation (4G) and the advertised speeds. *See id.* at para. 341 (providing a detailed discussion of speed benchmarks for purposes of the Pilot Program for mobile service). If the ETC is unable to meet the speed benchmarks set forth in the *Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM*, it should provide a detailed explanation of the justification for providing lower speeds and how the ETC's project would continue to be useful for consumers. *See id.* 

 $<sup>^{27}</sup>$  If an ETC chooses to impose usage limits for broadband offerings in the Pilot Program, it must include details on how a subscriber's service will be affected once the subscriber reaches the usage limit (*e.g.*, will the ETC impose overage charges or disconnect broadband service for the month or reduce broadband speeds).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> See Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM, FCC 12-11 at para. 344 (explaining how one of the main goals of the Pilot Program will be to focus on the goal of increasing broadband adoption by low-income consumers who do not currently subscribe to broadband service).

9. A description of what customer service support will be available to subscribers participating in the pilot project;

(C) A detailed explanation of how the ETC's project will address barriers to broadband adoption other than cost, including but not limited to:

1. Whether the ETC's project will provide digital literacy training and what form that will take;

2. Whether the project will provide free or discounted hardware, including aircards, modems, laptops (notebooks), tablets, desktops, or other mobile devices, to the subscribers; who will supply and pay for the free or discounted hardware; whether the subscribers will bear any of the cost of the discounted hardware; and the cost the ETC will require the subscriber to pay; and

- (D) The name and a description of the qualifications of any individuals or entities the ETC proposes to partner with in designing or implementing the proposed pilot project, and a detailed explanation of the role of the partner(s), if any, including whether they have existing or planned adoption efforts that provide for a more holistic approach to overcoming broadband adoption barriers, including digital literacy, equipment costs, and relevance;<sup>29</sup>
- (E) A detailed explanation of the design, data gathering and evaluation component of the project, including:

1. All details regarding the design of the project(s), which includes: (a) the planning, execution and analysis of the field experiment with control groups, if applicable;<sup>30</sup> (b) explanation of how the proposed project(s) will inform the Commission concerning the causal impact of the variations on broadband service; (c) if applicable, how the project(s) will apply randomization, i.e. the process of randomly determining how consumers are assigned into control groups;<sup>31</sup> (d) how the project(s) will mitigate any sources of statistical bias, if designed as a field experiment;<sup>32</sup> and (e) how it will obtain sufficient sample size; and

2. Details of how the ETC plans to collect the standardized data that must be submitted to USAC, as described in Appendix, including whether the ETC will seek to have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> See id. at para. 352 (explaining importance of partnerships with entities that have existing adoption programs).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> See id. at para. 326 (encouraging ETCs to utilize control groups when developing proposals in order to better assess the impact on adoption of the project).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> For example, ETCs have the option of applying geographic randomization (*e.g.*, cluster sampling design) in their studies based on census tracts, census blocks or zip code such that one variation of a broadband offering (*e.g.*, \$10 discount amount) is offered in one zip code and a different variation (*e.g.*, \$20 discount amount) is offered in an adjacent zip code to determine which variation is more effective in increasing broadband adoption.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Examples of statistical bias include randomization bias, attrition bias and substation bias. *See* Steven D. Levitt and John A. List, *Field Experiments in Economics: the Past, the Present and the Future,* European Economic Review, at 6-7 (2009) (discussing the types of bias that could occur when conducting field experiments); *see also* John A. List, Sally Sadoff and Mathis Wagner, *So You Want to Run an Experiment? Some Simple Rules of Thumb for Optimal Experiment Design*, Carlo Alberto Notebooks, No. 125 (Dec. 2009).

USAC collect that data;

3. If the ETC plans to collect data from its subscribers in addition to the standardized data that must be collected, as described in Appendix, details of the types of data the ETC plans to collect from its subscribers relating to broadband adoption and how it intends to collect that data;<sup>33</sup>

- (F) A detailed explanation of how the ETC will comply with the Commission's new rules relating to determinations of subscriber eligibility for Lifeline-supported services by applying all of the consumer eligibility and enrollment procedures as detailed in section VI and Appendix C of the *Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM*, and a copy of the ETC's certification form for enrollment that will be used during the Pilot Program;<sup>34</sup>
- (G) A description of how the ETC will transition its broadband subscribers at the conclusion of the ETC's project once the discount has ended and any copies of any notices that the ETC would send to its subscribers explaining this transition;
- (H) If the ETC and its partners intend to submit a final report to supplement the information collected on the Low-Income Broadband Pilot Program Reporting Form, a general description of the types of analysis that will be included in the final report submitted to the Commission at the end of the program. The description should include hypotheses tested and how the analysis addresses the goal of identifying effective approaches to increasing low-income broadband adoption and retention. The description may also explain how, once the study is complete, the costs of converting a non-adopter to adopter will be calculated and presented in the report; and
- (I) Any other information necessary to fully describe the project.

II. All applications must include the following certifications, executed by an officer of the ETC under penalty of perjury:

- (A) That the ETC intends to offer broadband service pursuant to the Commission's rules and regulations for the Lifeline program;
- (B) That the ETC will implement all necessary procedures and efforts to prevent waste, fraud and abuse in connection with its participation in the Pilot Program, including but not limited to procedures that the ETC will have in place to prevent duplicate broadband subsidies within its subscriber base, and procedures the carrier undertakes to de-enroll subscribers receiving more than one broadband discount per household;
- (C) That the ETC's broadband service offering(s) will provide sufficiently low latency to enable use of real-time applications such as Voice over Internet Protocol (VoIP) and if there are usage

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> See Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM, FCC 12-11 at para. 336 (detailing the data gathering and sharing component of the Pilot Project). In the event the ETC modifies the survey questions listed on Appendix or asks additional questions, it must include formatted datasets with the raw subscriber-level data used in the final analysis, and a data dictionary accompanying the datasets, with the exact wording used in any surveys the ETC conducts during its project.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> See id. at section VI, Appendix C, para. 343.

limits for each plan, that they are reasonably comparable to usage limits for comparable broadband offerings in urban areas;<sup>35</sup> and

(D) That the ETC will participate in the collection and sharing of anonymized qualitative and quantitative data with standardized data elements, formatting, and submission requirements, and that the ETC will participate in workshops to discuss interim and final results of the project, and how best to use limited universal service funds to increase low-income consumers' adoption of broadband services.<sup>36</sup>

The Bureau will notify applicants and USAC when it has selected applicants to participate in the In order to receive reimbursement for approved subsidies, applicants selected to Pilot Program. participate in the Pilot Program will have to complete the Low Income Broadband Reimbursement Form on a monthly basis and submit it to USAC, similar to how Lifeline reimbursement is submitted, for (i) any monthly discount of broadband service, (ii) applicable discount amount for voice telephony service if the broadband subscriber is also subscribing to voice telephony service under the Lifeline program, and (iii) any non-recurring fees for broadband provided to subscribers participating in the Pilot Program and approved as part of a pilot project.<sup>37</sup> As described above, selected applicants will also be expected to complete the Low Income Broadband Pilot Program Reporting Form, attached as Appendix, and submit it to USAC during the 12-month period in which the ETC offers subsidized broadband service, or authorize USAC to collect the requisite information.<sup>38</sup> Within three months after the conclusion of the 12-month period of offering subsidized broadband service, each ETC is strongly encouraged to submit a report to the Bureau describing in detail any data collected in addition to the data specified in Appendix and a narrative describing the lessons learned from the Pilot Program, which may assist the Commission in modernizing the Lifeline program to promote the adoption and retention of broadband services by lowincome households.<sup>39</sup>

## Application Filing Procedures:

ETCs must file their applications in **WC Docket No. 11-42**. Applications may be filed using the Commission's Electronic Comment Filing System (ECFS) or by filing paper copies.<sup>40</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> *See id.* at para. 342.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> See id. at para. 354 (discussing ETC's required commitment to participate in workshops).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> If an ETC participating in the Pilot Program offers voice and broadband bundled service, it should claim the Lifeline reimbursement for voice telephony service on the Low Income Broadband Reimbursement Form, rather than the FCC Form 497. ETCs, however, will continue to receive reimbursement for voice telephony service using the FCC Form 497 for subscribers that subscribe only to voice telephony service.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> In order to complete the Low Income Broadband Pilot Program Reporting Form, ETCs are expected to collect such information directly from their subscribers and to summarize the data in the format designated on the Low Income Broadband Pilot Program Reporting Form and submit it to USAC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> *Lifeline Reform Order and FNPRM*, FCC 12-11 at para. 325 (explaining how the last three months of the ETC's project should focus on finalizing data collection and analysis).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> See Electronic Filing of Documents in Rulemaking Proceedings, GC Dkt. No. 97-113, Report and Order, 13 FCC Rcd 11322 (1998).

- Electronic Filers: Applications may be filed electronically using the Internet by accessing the ECFS: <u>http://apps.fcc.gov/ecfs</u>.
- Paper Filers: Parties who choose to file by paper must file an original and one copy of each filing. If more than one docket or rulemaking number appears in the caption of this proceeding, filers must submit two additional copies for each additional docket or rulemaking number.

Filings can be sent by hand or messenger delivery, by commercial overnight courier, or by firstclass or overnight U.S. Postal Service mail. All filings must be addressed to the Commission's Secretary, Office of the Secretary, Federal Communications Commission.

All hand-delivered or messenger-delivered paper filings for the Commission's Secretary must be delivered to FCC Headquarters at 445 12th St., SW, Room TW-A325, Washington, D.C. 20554. All hand deliveries must be held together with rubber bands or fasteners. Any envelopes must be disposed of <u>before</u> entering the building. The filing hours are 8:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m.

Commercial overnight mail (other than U.S. Postal Service Express Mail and Priority Mail) must be sent to 9300 East Hampton Drive, Capitol Heights, MD 20743.

U.S. Postal Service first-class, Express, and Priority mail must be addressed to 445 12th Street, S.W., Washington D.C. 20554.

People with Disabilities: To request materials in accessible formats for people with disabilities (Braille, large print, electronic files, audio format), send an e-mail to fcc504@fcc.gov or call the Consumer & Governmental Affairs Bureau at (202) 418-0530 (voice), (202) 418-0432 (tty).

## In addition, one copy of each application must be sent to each of the following:

- The Commission's duplicating contractor, Best Copy and Printing, Inc., 445 12th Street, S.W., Room CY-B402, Washington, D.C. 20554, <u>www.bcpiweb.com</u>; phone: (202) 488-5300 fax: (202) 488-5563;
- (2) Kimberly Scardino, Telecommunications Access Policy Division, Wireline Competition Bureau, 445 12th Street, S.W., Room 5-B442, Washington, D.C. 20554; e-mail: kimberly.scardino@fcc.gov;
- (3) Garnet Hanly, Telecommunications Access Policy Division, Wireline Competition Bureau, 445 12th Street, S.W., Room 5-B442, Washington, D.C. 20554; e-mail: garnet.hanly@fcc.gov; and
- (4) Charles Tyler, Telecommunications Access Policy Division, Wireline Competition Bureau, 445 12th Street, S.W., Room 5-A452, Washington, D.C. 20554; e-mail: <u>charles.tyler@fcc.gov</u>.

Filings are also available for public inspection and copying during regular business hours at the FCC Reference Information Center, Portals II, 445 12th Street, S.W., Room CY-A257, Washington, D.C. 20554. They may also be purchased from the Commission's duplicating contractor, Best Copy and Printing, Inc., Portals II, 445 12th Street, S.W., Room CY-B402, Washington, D.C. 20554, telephone: (202) 488-5300, fax: (202) 488-5563, or via e-mail www.bcpiweb.com.

This matter shall be treated as a "permit-but-disclose" proceeding in accordance with the Commission's *ex parte* rules.<sup>41</sup> Persons making *ex parte* presentations must file a copy of any written presentation or a memorandum summarizing any oral presentation within two business days after the presentation (unless a different deadline applicable to the Sunshine period applies). Persons making oral *ex parte* presentations are reminded that memoranda summarizing the presentation must (1) list all persons attending or otherwise participating in the meeting at which the *ex parte* presentation was made, and (2) summarize all

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> 47 C.F.R. §§ 1.1200 et seq.

data presented and arguments made during the presentation. If the presentation consisted in whole or in part of the presentation of data or arguments already reflected in the presenter's written comments, memoranda or other filings in the proceeding, the presenter may provide citations to such data or arguments in his or her prior comments, memoranda, or other filings (specifying the relevant page and/or paragraph numbers where such data or arguments can be found) in lieu of summarizing them in the memorandum. Documents shown or given to Commission staff during *ex parte* meetings are deemed to be written *ex parte* presentations and must be filed consistent with rule 1.1206(b). In proceedings governed by rule 1.49(f) or for which the Commission has made available a method of electronic filing, written *ex parte* presentations and memoranda summarizing oral *ex parte* presentations, and all attachments thereto, must be filed through the electronic comment filing system available for that proceeding, and must be filed in their native format (*e.g.*, .doc, .xml, .ppt, searchable .pdf). Participants in this proceeding should familiarize themselves with the Commission's *ex parte* rules.

For further information, please contact Kimberly Scardino or Garnet Hanly, Telecommunications Access Policy Division, Wireline Competition Bureau at (202) 418-7400 or TTY (202) 418-0484.

- FCC -

## APPENDIX

# Low Income Broadband Pilot Program Reporting Form

# COMPANY INFORMATION PROVIDED BY ETC WITH EACH SUBMISSION TO USAC **BLOCK A**

Each ETC is required to submit the company specific information contained in block "Identifying Information - Block A" for each submission to USAC. All raw data that the ETC submits may be submitted as an Excel or CSV file.

Notes											Each variation of a proposed broadband service offering that an ETC offers in its project will be assigned a separate project code identifier by USAC (Project Code Identifier).
Response											
Question	Service Provider Identification Number (SPIN)	Study Area Code(s) (SAC)	FCC Registration Number (FRN)	Legal Company Name and d/b/a	Company Mailing Address	Company Telephone Number	Company Fax number	Company Contact Email Address	Reporting Date	Company Contact Name	List of Project Code Identifiers in Pilot Project
Block A			ι	ıoiĵ	ខយ	roî	uj ĉ	ðui/	(titr	qer	I

## PROJECT-LEVEL INFORMATION PROVIDED BY ETC BLOCK B

Each ETC is required to submit information contained in block "Broadband Service Offering Information - Block B" to USAC once, at the beginning of the ETC's project for each Project Code Identifier.

	sut		of
Notes	Identifies the study group in terms of discount plans	Identifies relevant geographies being treated in study	List all zip codes fully or partially in this variation of broadband offering
Response			
Question	Project Code Identifier	List of geographic areas ( <i>e.g.</i> , census tract, wire center, study area) receiving this variation of the broadband service offering	Zip Codes receiving this variation of broadband service offering
Block B		riə <b>S brisdbe</b> smrofnl gnir	

ROJECT-LEVEL INFORMATION PROVIDED BY ETC		
<b>PROJECT-LEVEL I</b>	BLOCK C	

Each ETC is required to submit information contained in block "Project Information - Block C," to USAC once, at the beginning of the ETC's project for each Project Code Identifier.

	offered in study				spond with N/A.	spond with N/A. If , respond with N/A	spond with N/A. If seding usage limits,					ent at no cost, please /en to subscriber		
Notes	Number of months discount is offered in study			Provide advertised speeds.	If usage limits do not apply, respond with N/A.	If usage limits do not apply, respond with N/A. If overage charges do not apply, respond with N/A	If usage limits do not apply, respond with N/A. If overage charges apply for exceeding usage limits, respond with N/A.					If subscriber receives equipment at no cost, please include value of equipment given to subscriber		
Response	0 - 12	Bundled Voice & BB; Stand- alone BB	Mobile, Fixed-wireless, Wireline (Telco or Cable), Other (indicate)	specify upload and download speed	GB/month	\$	Discontinued service, broadband speed is reduced, none of the above (specify)	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$	€	Yes/No
Question	Maximum number of months discount is available	Type of service offering	Technology used	Broadband speed provided	Monthly usage limit, if any	If monthly usage limit applies, whether overage charges apply and if so, specify rate amount	If monthly usage limit applies with no overage charges, specify whether service is discontinued or broadband speed is reduced	Monthly broadband discount amount	Monthly cost to subscriber for broadband service after discount	Amount of discount provided to reduce or eliminate non-recurring fee(s), if any	Amount of non-recurring fees, if any, charged to subscriber after discount	Amount of discount for equipment provided to subscriber by ETC, if any	Cost to subscriber of equipment provided by ETC that is used for broadband after discount	Digital literacy training offered as part of broadband service offering
Block C						U	Information	ţĊŧ	Proj					

## PROJECT-LEVEL INFORMATION PROVIDED BY ETC BLOCK D

Each ETC is required to submit information contained in block "Aggregate Population Information for Variations of Broadband Service Offering - Block D" to USAC on a quarterly basis for each Project Code Identifier. If necessary provide a best estimate.

I									
Notes	Identifies the study group in terms of discount plans	Estimate if necessary, explaining your assumptions	Estimate if necessary, explaining your assumptions						
Response									
Question	Project Code Identifier	Total number of Lifeline eligible subscribers in study population	Total number of eligible subscribers offered this variation of broadband service during the pilot	Total number of subscribers enrolled in the offered discount during the first month of the quarter	Total number of subscribers enrolled in the discount during the second month of the quarter	Total number of subscribers enrolled in the offered discount during the third month of the quarter	Total number of subscribers that have de-enrolled in the offered discount during the first month of the quarter	Total number of subscribers that have de-enrolled in the offered discount during the second month of the quarter	Total number of subscribers that have de-enrolled in the offered discount during third month of the quarter
Block D	90iv	iəS bri	Broadba	to noits	ז for Vari fering	formatioi Ofi	nl noitsl	uqo¶ əte	Aggreg

## SUBSCRIBER-LEVEL INFORMATION PROVIDED BY ETC BLOCK E

Each ETC is required to submit the information contained in block "EnrolIment Information - Block E" to USAC when all subscribers have enrolled in the ETC's project. Each subscriber must have a unique identifier, which will be used throughout the study, assigned by the ETC (Unique Subscriber Identifier).

Block E	Question	Response	Notes
u	Unique Subscriber Identifier		Unique, anonymized identifier assigned by ETC
oitsm	Project Code Identifier		Identifies the subscriber's study group in terms of discount plan
tot	Geographic Area		
ul ì	Zip code(s)		
นอเ	Date Subscribed	MM/DD/YY	
ullo	Digital Literacy Program Offered?	Yes/No	
Enro	Digital Literacy Offer Accepted at Enrollment?	Yes/No	Only enter if literacy program is offered to subscriber

## Provided by ETC

## SUBSCRIBER-LEVEL INFORMATION PROVIDED BY ETC BLOCK F

Each ETC is required to submit the information contained in block "Follow-Up and Retention Information – Block F" based on subscriber records within three months after the subscriber received the last discount in the pilot. Each subscriber must have a unique identifier, which will be used throughout the study, assigned by the ETC (Unique Subscriber Identifier).

Block F	Question	Response	Notes
	Unique Subscriber Identifier		Unique, anonymized identifier assigned by the ETC
	Project Code Identifier		Identifies the subscriber's study group in terms of discount plan
noite	Did the subscriber participate in the study for the full duration of the program?	Yes/No	
mioîn	Number of months of discount actually received	0-12	
ıl noit	If not currently subscribing, date service ended	MM/DD/YY	If customer ended service, indicate date ended
nə <del>î</del> əЯ bns q	Did subscriber retain service with the ETC in the first month following the last discount (i.e. the first unsubsidized month)?	Yes/No	
IU-wollo <del>1</del>	Did subscriber retain service with the ETC in the second month following the last discount (i.e. the second unsubsidized month)?	Yes/No	
	Did subscriber retain service with the ETC in the third month following the last discount (i.e. the third unsubsidized month)?	Yes/No	

Provided by ETC

## SUBSCRIBER-LEVEL INFORMATION COLLECTED FROM THE SUBSCRIBER **BLOCK G**

Each ETC, or USAC if the ETC requests, is required to collect the information contained in block "Subscriber-Provided Information at Enrollment – Block information in order to receive any discount. Each subscriber must have a unique identifier, which will be used throughout the study, assigned by the ETC (Unique Subscriber Identifier). G" directly from each subscriber prior to providing a discount and submit when all subscribers have enrolled in the project. ETCs have the option of having USAC collect this information through an electronic, online survey at enrollment; subscribers must consent to collection and sharing of this

			C	ollected f	rom Sub	scriber	
Notes	Unique, anonymized identifier assigned by the ETC	Identifies the subscriber's study group in terms of discount plan					
Response						Less than \$5,000, \$5000-\$9999 \$10,000-\$20,000, \$20,001-\$30,000, \$30,001 or more, Not Determined	Desktop Computer, Laptop/netbook computer, Tablet, Mobile device (smartphone), mobile broadband modem (aircard)
Question	Unique Subscriber Identifier	Project Code Identifier	Subscriber Age	Ages of household members	Number of household members using subsidized broadband	In 2011, what was this household's total income before taxes?	Equipment expected to be used with broadband service - choose multiple
Block G	;	nrollmen	3 te	s noitem	ıofni bəb	riber-Provid	osqnS

		Answer NA if previous answer is "Never"	
Never, Within last 3 months, Within last 6 months, Within last 12 months, More than 12 months ago	Monthly cost too expensive, didn't use service, don't know how to use computer/Internet, uncomfortable with Internet (e.g. privacy concerns, dangerous for children), happy with dial- up, could access Internet elsewhere, other – specify	Monthly cost too expensive, didn't use service, the equipment no longer worked, don't know how to use computer/Internet, uncomfortable with Internet (e.g. privacy concerns, dangerous for children), happy with dial-up, could access Internet elsewhere	Want to stay in touch with family and friends, children need it for school, subscriber needs it for school, want to access music, movies and other entertainment, children want internet access, get health care or medical information, job required online access, need it for job searches, want to share photos or videos with family and friends, internet provider offered a good price for the service, use for daily activities (e.g. check bus schedule), other specify
Has this consumer subscribed to broadband in the past?	Reasons for not previously obtaining broadband - can choose more than one	If subscriber previously subscribed to broadband, but dropped service, reason for dropping (can choose more than one response)	Reason(s) for use of Internet (can choose more than one response)

SUBSCRIBER-LEVEL INFORMATION COLLECTED FROM THE SUBSCRIBER BLOCK H

Information – Block H" from the subscriber no later than the end of the project. ETCs have the option of having USAC collect this information through an electronic, online survey; subscribers must consent to collection and sharing of this information in order to continue receiving any discounted broadband service. Each subscriber must have a unique identifier, which will be used throughout the study, assigned by the ETC (Unique Subscriber Identifier). Each ETC, or USAC if the ETC requests, must collect the information contained in block "Follow-up and Subscriber Usage

		Collected from	Subscriber
Notes	Unique, anonymized identifier assigned by the ETC	Identifies the subscriber's study group in terms of discount plan	
Response			
Question	Unique Subscriber Identifier	Project Code Identifier	Number of Household members using discounted broadband service
Block H	дe	Subscriber-Usa mation	

Want to stay in touch with family and friends, children need it for school, subscriber needs it for school, want to access music, movies and other entertainment, children want internet access, job required online access, need it for job searches, want to share photos or videos with family and friends, internet provider offered a good price for the service, use for daily activities (paying bills), other	No training class taken, currently taking a training class, completed a training class	Desktop Computer, Laptop Computer (includes netbook), Tablet, Mobile Device (Smartphone) Mobile Broadband Modem (aircard)
Subscriber use of Internet (can choose more than one response)	Did the subscriber participate or is currently participating in any training programs so he/she can better use a computer and the Internet?	Equipment used with service (can choose more than one response)