# Before the Federal Communications Commission Washington, D.C. 20554

| In re Application of                    | ) |                               |
|---|---|-------------------------------|
| Lighthouse Ministries of Northwest Ohio | ) | Facility ID No. 131382        |
|   | ) | NAL/Acct. No. MB-202141410021 |
| For Renewal of License for              | ) | FRN: 0006097810               |
| Station WKJH-LP                         | ) | File No. 0000125074           |
| Bryan, Ohio                             | Ĵ |                               |

#### MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER AND NOTICE OF APPARENT LIABILITY FOR FORFEITURE

#### Adopted: March 8, 2021

Released: March 8, 2021

By the Chief, Audio Division, Media Bureau:

# I. INTRODUCTION

1. The Media Bureau (Bureau) has before it the application (Application)<sup>1</sup> of Lighthouse Ministries of Northwest Ohio (Licensee) for renewal of its license for low-power FM (LPFM) Station WKJH-LP, Bryan, Ohio (Station). In this *Memorandum Opinion and Order and Notice of Apparent Liability for Forfeiture* (*NAL*)<sup>2</sup> we find that Licensee apparently willfully violated section 73.3539 of the Rules<sup>3</sup> by failing to file a timely license renewal application for the Station, and willfully and repeatedly violated section 301 of the Act<sup>4</sup> by engaging in unauthorized operation of the Station after its authorization had expired. Based upon our review of the record before us, we conclude that Licensee is apparently liable for a monetary forfeiture in the amount of three thousand five hundred dollars (\$3,500).

#### II. BACKGROUND

2. Section 73.3539(a) of the Rules requires that applications for renewal of license for broadcast stations must be filed "not later than the first day of the fourth full calendar month prior to the expiration date of the license sought to be renewed."<sup>5</sup> An application for renewal of the Station's license should have been filed by June 1, 2020, four months prior to the license expiration date of October 1, 2020,<sup>6</sup> but was not. Accordingly, on September 4, 2020, the staff, by Public Notice, notified the Licensee that the Station's license would expire on October 1, 2020, if no renewal application was filed by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> File No. 0000125074.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This *NAL* is issued pursuant to sections 309(k) and 503(b) of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended (Act), and section 1.80 of the FCC's rules (Rules). *See* 47 U.S.C. §§ 309(k), 503(b); 47 CFR § 1.80. The Bureau has delegated authority to issue the *NAL* under section 0.283 of the Rules. *See* 47 CFR § 0.283.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See 47 CFR § 73.3539.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See 47 U.S.C. § 301.

<sup>5 47</sup> CFR § 73.3539(a).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See 47 CFR §§ 73.1020, 73.3539(a).

midnight that day.<sup>7</sup> Licensee did not file a renewal application, and the Bureau issued a Public Notice announcing the Station's license had expired.<sup>8</sup>

3. On October 27, 2020, Licensee filed the Application.<sup>9</sup> On that same date, Licensee also filed a Petition for Reconsideration requesting reinstatement of its license for the Station.<sup>10</sup> In the Petition, Licensee's program director, James Hollin, explains that he mistakenly believed that the license renewal application was due the following year, and states that he had several family issues occurring at the time the renewal application was due.<sup>11</sup> Licensee did not request special temporary authority (STA) to operate the Station following the expiration of the Station's license.

### **III. DISCUSSION**

4. *Proposed Forfeiture*. In this case, Licensee has failed to file a timely license renewal application for the Station as required by section 73.3539(a) of the Rules. Moreover, it continued operating the Station after the license expired on October 1, 2020, without requesting STA, in violation of section 301 of the Act. As noted above, Licensee's program director explains that the failure to timely file was due to his mistake.

5. This *NAL* is issued pursuant to section 503(b)(1)(B) of the Act. Under that provision, a person who is found to have willfully or repeatedly failed to comply with any provision of the Act or any rule, regulation, or order issued by the Commission shall be liable to the United States for a forfeiture penalty.<sup>12</sup> Section 312(f)(1) of the Act defines willful as "the conscious and deliberate commission or omission of [any] act, irrespective of any intent to violate" the law.<sup>13</sup> The legislative history to section 312(f)(1) of the Act clarifies that this definition of willful applies to both sections 312 and 503(b) of the Act,<sup>14</sup> and the Commission has so interpreted the term in the section 503(b) context.<sup>15</sup> Section 312(f)(2) of the Act provides that "[t]he term 'repeated,' when used with reference to the commission or omission of any act, means the commission of such act more than once or, if such commission or omission is continuous, for more than one day."<sup>16</sup>

6. The Commission's *Forfeiture Policy Statement* and section 1.80(b)(9) of the Rules establish a base forfeiture amount of \$3,000 for the failure to file a required form.<sup>17</sup> The guidelines also specify a base forfeiture amount of \$10,000 for construction and/or operation without an instrument of authorization for the service.<sup>18</sup> In determining the appropriate forfeiture amount, we may adjust the base amount upward or downward by considering the factors enumerated in section 503(b)(2)(E) of the Act,

<sup>11</sup> Id.

12 47 U.S.C. § 503(b)(1)(B). See also 47 CFR § 1.80(a)(1).

<sup>13</sup> 47 U.S.C. § 312(f)(1).

<sup>14</sup> See H.R. Rep. No. 97-765, 97<sup>th</sup> Cong. 2d Sess. 51 (1982).

<sup>15</sup> See Southern California Broad. Co., Memorandum Opinion and Order, 6 FCC Rcd 4387, 4388, para. 5 (1991), *recon. denied*, Memorandum Opinion and Order, 7 FCC Rcd 3454 (1992).

16 47 U.S.C. § 312(f)(2).

<sup>18</sup> A broadcast station requires an authorization from the Commission to operate. See 47 U.S.C. § 301.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See Radio License Expirations, Public Notice, 35 FCC Rcd 9455(MB 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Broadcast Actions, Public Notice, Report No. 49839 (MB Oct. 7, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See n.1, supra.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See Petition for Reconsideration of Lighthouse Ministers of Northwest Ohio, File No. BRL-20120629ACW (filed Oct. 27, 2020) (Petition).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> See Forfeiture Policy Statement and Amendment of Section 1.80(b) of the Rules to Incorporate the Forfeiture Guidelines, Report and Order, 12 FCC Rcd 17087, 17113-15 (1997) (Forfeiture Policy Statement), recon. denied, Memorandum Opinion and Order, 15 FCC Rcd 303 (1999); 47 CFR § 1.80(b)(9), note to paragraph (b)(9), Section I.

including "the nature, circumstances, extent and gravity of the violation, and, with respect to the violator, the degree of culpability, any history of prior offenses, ability to pay, and such other matters as justice may require."<sup>19</sup>

7. Although we are sympathetic to Mr. Hollin's family issues, we find that issuing a notice of apparent liability is still appropriate here. The Commission has held that violations resulting from inadvertent error or failure to become familiar with the Commission's requirements are willful violations.<sup>20</sup> Moreover, the Commission has long held that "licensees are responsible for the acts and omissions of their employees and independent contractors,"<sup>21</sup> and has consistently "refused to excuse licensees from forfeiture penalties where the actions of employees or independent contractors have resulted in violations."<sup>22</sup> The Licensee itself was ultimately responsible for ensuring it complied with the Rules by filing a timely renewal application. It did not do so.

8. Based on our review of the facts and circumstances, we tentatively find that a \$7,000 forfeiture is appropriate. Licensee failed to file a timely license renewal application for the Station, continued operating the Station after the license expired on October 1, 2020, and never filed for STA to operate the Station after its license expired. Taking into consideration all of the factors required by section 503(b)(2)(E) of the Act and the *Forfeiture Policy Statement*, we propose a forfeiture for the full \$3,000 amount for the failure to file a timely renewal application but reduce the proposed forfeiture for the unauthorized operation from the \$10,000 base amount to \$4,000.<sup>23</sup> Accordingly, we tentatively find that, considering the record as a whole, a \$7,000 forfeiture is appropriate for the violations in this case.<sup>24</sup> However, we will reduce the forfeiture from the base amount to \$1,500 for the failure to file a timely license renewal application and to \$2,000 for unauthorized operations, for a total of \$3,500, because, as an LPFM station, the Station is providing a secondary service.<sup>25</sup>

9. *License Renewal Application.* In evaluating an application for license renewal, the Commission's decision is governed by section 309(k) of the Act.<sup>26</sup> That section provides that if, upon consideration of the application and pleadings, we find that (1) the station has served the public interest, convenience, and necessity; (2) there have been no serious violations of the Act or the Rules; and (3) there have been no other violations which, taken together, constitute a pattern of abuse, we are to grant the renewal application.<sup>27</sup> If, however, the licensee fails to meet that standard, the Commission may deny

<sup>20</sup> Whidbey Island Center for the Arts, Forfeiture Order, 25 FCC Rcd 8204 (MB 2010) (Whidbey Island Forfeiture Order) (citing PJB Communications of Virginia, Inc., Memorandum Opinion and Order, 7 FCC Rcd 2088 (1992); Southern California Broadcasting Co., Memorandum Opinion and Order, 6 FCC Rcd 4387, 4387 (1991), recon. denied, 7 FCC Rcd 3454 (1992) (stating that "inadvertence ... is at best, ignorance of the law, which the Commission does not consider a mitigating circumstance"); Standard Communications Corp., Memorandum Opinion and Order, 1 FCC Rcd 358 (1986) (stating that "employee acts or omissions, such as clerical errors in failing to file required forms, do not excuse violations")).

<sup>21</sup> Whidbey Island Forfeiture Order, 25 FCC Rcd at 8205, para 6.

<sup>22</sup> Id.

<sup>23</sup> See 47 CFR § 1.80, note to paragraph (b)(9), sec. I, Base Amounts for Section 503 Forfeitures.

<sup>24</sup> See, e.g., Chisholm Trail Commc'ns, LLC, Memorandum Opinion and Order and Notice of Apparent Liability for Forfeiture, 33 FCC Rcd 107 (MB 2018) (\$7,000 forfeiture assessed where licensee failed to timely file renewal application and continued station operations after expiration of license).

<sup>25</sup> See, e.g., Virginia Center for Public Press, Memorandum Opinion and Order and Notice of Apparent Liability, 34 FCC Rcd 9312 (MB 2019) (reducing \$3,000 base forfeiture to \$1,500 for untimely filed renewal application for LPFM station).

26 47 U.S.C. § 309(k).

27 47 U.S.C. § 309(k)(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> 47 U.S.C. § 503(b)(2)(E); see also Forfeiture Policy Statement, 12 FCC Rcd at 17100; 47 C.F.R. § 1.80(b)(8).

the application—after notice and opportunity for a hearing under section 309(e) of the Act—or grant the application "on terms and conditions that are appropriate, including a renewal for a term less than the maximum otherwise permitted."<sup>28</sup>

10. We find that Licensee's apparent violation of section 73.3539 of the Rules and section 301 of the Act do not present "serious violations" warranting designation for evidentiary hearing. Moreover, we find no evidence of violations that, when considered together, constitute a pattern of abuse.<sup>29</sup> Further, based on our review of the Application, we find that the Station served the public interest, convenience, and necessity during the subject license term. We will therefore grant the Application by separate action upon the conclusion of this forfeiture proceeding if there are no issues other than the apparent violation that would preclude grant of the Application.

# IV. ORDERING CLAUSES

11. Accordingly, **IT IS ORDERED**, pursuant to section 503(b) of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, and section 1.80 of the Commission's rules,<sup>30</sup> that Lighthouse Ministries of Northwest Ohio is hereby **NOTIFIED** of its **APPARENT LIABILITY FOR FORFEITURE** in the amount of three thousand five hundred dollars (\$3,500) for its apparent willful violation of section 73.3539 of the Commission's rules and its apparent willful and repeated violation of section 301 of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended.

12. **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED**, pursuant to section 1.80 of the Commission's rules, that, within thirty (30) days of the release date of this *NAL*, Lighthouse Ministries of Northwest Ohio **SHALL PAY** the full amount of the proposed forfeiture or **SHALL FILE** a written statement seeking reduction or cancellation of the proposed forfeiture.

13. Payment of the forfeiture must be made by credit card, ACH (Automated Clearing House) debit from a bank account using the Commission's Fee Filer (the Commission's online payment system),<sup>31</sup> or by wire transfer. The Commission no longer accepts forfeiture payments by check or money order. Below are instructions that payors should follow based on the form of payment selected:<sup>32</sup>

 Payment by wire transfer must be made to ABA Number 021030004, receiving bank TREAS/NYC, and Account Number 27000001. A completed Form 159 must be faxed to the Federal Communications Commission at 202-418-2843 or e-mailed to <u>RROGWireFaxes@fcc.gov</u> on the same business day the wire transfer is initiated. Failure to provide all required information in Form 159 may result in payment not being recognized as having been received. When completing FCC Form 159, enter the Account Number in block number 23A (call sign/other ID), enter the letters "FORF" in block number 24A (payment type code), and enter in block number 11 the FRN(s) captioned above (Payor FRN).<sup>33</sup> For

<sup>31</sup> Payments made using the Commission's Fee Filer system do not require the submission of an FCC Form 159.

<sup>28 47</sup> U.S.C. §§ 309(k)(2), 309(k)(3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> For example, we do not find here that Licensee's operation of the Station "was conducted in an exceedingly careless, inept and negligent manner and that the licensee is either incapable of correcting or unwilling to correct the operating deficiencies." *See Heart of the Black Hills Stations*, Decision, 32 FCC 2d 196, 198, para. 6 (1971). Nor do we find on the record here that "the number, nature and extent" of the violations indicate that "the licensee cannot be relied upon to operate [the Station] in the future in accordance with the requirements of its licenses and the Commission's Rules." *Id.* at 200. *Compare with Center for Study and Application of Black Economic Development*, Hearing Designation Order, 6 FCC Rcd 4622 (1991), *Calvary Educational Broad. Network, Inc.*, Hearing Designation Order, 7 FCC Rcd 4037 (1992).

<sup>30 47</sup> U.S.C. § 503(b); 47 CFR § 1.80.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> For questions regarding payment procedures, please contact the Financial Operations Group Help Desk by phone at 1-877-480-3201 (option #6), or by e-mail at <u>ARINQUIRIES@fcc.gov</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Instructions for completing the form may be obtained at <u>https://www.fcc.gov/Forms/Form159/159.pdf</u>.

additional detail and wire transfer instructions, go to <u>https://www.fcc.gov/licensing-databases/fees/wire-transfer</u>.

- Payment by credit card must be made by using the Commission's Fee Filer website at <a href="https://apps.fcc.gov/FeeFiler/login.cfm">https://apps.fcc.gov/FeeFiler/login.cfm</a>. To pay by credit card, log in using the FRN captioned above. If payment must be split across FRNs, complete this process for each FRN. Next, select "Pay bills" on the Fee Filer Menu, and select the bill number associated with the NAL Account the bill number is the NAL Account number with the first two digits excluded and then choose the "Pay by Credit Card" option. Please note that there is a dollar limitation on credit card transactions, which cannot exceed \$24,999.99.
- Payment by ACH must be made by using the Commission's Fee Filer website at
   <u>https://apps.fcc.gov/FeeFiler/login.cfm</u>. To pay by ACH, log in using the FRN captioned
   above. If payment must be split across FRNs, complete this process for each FRN. Next,
   select "Pay bills" on the Fee Filer Menu and then select the bill number associated to the
   NAL Account—the bill number is the NAL Account number with the first two digits
   excluded—and choose the "Pay from Bank Account" option. Please contact the appropriate
   financial institution to confirm the correct Routing Number and the correct account number
   from which payment will be made and verify with that financial institution that the
   designated account has authorization to accept ACH transactions.

14. Any request for making full payment over time under an installment plan should be sent to: Associate Managing Director—Financial Operations, Federal Communications Commission, 45 L Street, N.E., Washington, DC 20554.<sup>34</sup> Questions regarding payment procedures should be directed to the Financial Operations Group Help Desk by phone, 1-877-480-3201 (option #6), or by e-mail at <u>ARINQUIRIES@fcc.gov</u>.

15. Any written response seeking reduction or cancellation of the proposed forfeiture must include a detailed factual statement supported by appropriate documentation and affidavits pursuant to sections 1.16 and 1.80(f)(3) of the Commission's rules.<sup>35</sup> The written response must be filed with the Office of the Secretary, Federal Communications Commission, 45 L Street NE, Washington DC 20554, ATTN: Albert Shuldiner, Chief, Audio Division, Media Bureau, and **MUST INCLUDE** the NAL/Acct. No. referenced above. Filings can be sent by commercial overnight courier, or by first-class or overnight U.S. Postal Service mail. All filings must be addressed to the Commission's Secretary, Office of the Secretary, Federal Communications Commission.<sup>36</sup> A courtesy copy emailed to Alexander.Sanjenis@fcc.gov will assist in processing the response.

- Commercial overnight mail (other than U.S. Postal Service Express Mail and Priority Mail) must be sent to 9050 Junction Drive, Annapolis Junction, MD 20701.
- Postal Service first-class, Express, and Priority mail must be addressed to 45 L Street, NE, Washington, DC 20554.

16. The Commission will not consider reducing or canceling a forfeiture in response to a claim of inability to pay unless the respondent submits: (1) federal tax returns for the most recent three-year period; (2) financial statements prepared according to generally accepted accounting practices (GAAP); or (3) some other reliable and objective documentation that accurately reflects the respondent's current financial status. Any claim of inability to pay must specifically identify the basis for the claim by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> See 47 CFR § 1.1914.

<sup>35 47</sup> CFR §§ 1.16 and 1.80(f)(3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Effective March 19, 2020, and until further notice, the Commission no longer accepts any hand or messenger delivered filings. This is a temporary measure taken to help protect the health and safety of individuals, and to mitigate the transmission of COVID-19. *See FCC Announces Closure of FCC Headquarters Open Window and Change in Hand-Delivery Filing*, Public Notice, 35 FCC Rcd 2788 (2020).

reference to the financial documentation submitted. Inability to pay, however, is only one of several factors that the Commission will consider in determining the appropriate forfeiture, and we have discretion to not reduce or cancel the forfeiture if other prongs of section 503(b)(2)(E) of the Communications Act of 1934, as amended, support that result.<sup>37</sup>

17. **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that the Petition for Reconsideration filed by Lighthouse Ministries of Northwest Ohio on October 27, 2020, IS GRANTED.

18. **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that copies of this *NAL* shall be sent by First Class and Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested, to James D. Hollin, Lighthouse Ministries of Northwest Ohio, PO Box 43506, Bryan, OH 43506, and to Kimberly J. Hollin, Lighthouse Ministries of Northwest Ohio, 3433 CR 17, Bryan, OH 43506

FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

Albert Shuldiner Chief, Audio Division Media Bureau

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> See 47 U.S.C. 503(b)(2)(E); Adrian Abramovich, Forfeiture Order, 33 FCC Rcd 4663, 4678-79, paras. 44-45 (2018).